

Appendix D: Evaluation of Accomplishments under the Adopted 2015-2023 Housing Element

As part of the periodic review of the housing element, each local government is required to evaluate its progress toward achieving the goals contained in the previous Housing Element. This evaluation includes a discussion of: 1) the effectiveness of the Housing Element in the attainment of the stated housing goal; 2) an analysis of the significant differences between what was projected and what was achieved; and 3) a description of how the Housing Program should be updated and incorporated, if appropriate, as part of the Housing Element Update. Where significant shortfalls exist between what was planned and what was achieved, the reasons for such differences must be documented.

Table D.1 summarizes Mill Valley's program accomplishments, followed by a review of its quantified objectives in Table D.2. The results of this analysis provide the basis for development of the program strategy for Mill Valley's 2023-2031 Housing Element.

Evaluation of 2015-2023 Housing Plan

Mill Valley's 2015-2023 Housing Element is structured around the following housing goals:

Housing and Neighborhood Quality

- **GOAL 1.0:** Maintain and enhance the quality and affordability of existing housing and ensure new development is compatible with Mill Valley's small-town character and many environmental, community, neighborhood and scenic attributes.

Housing Supply and Diversity

- **GOAL 2.0:** Provide opportunities for a range of housing types suited to residents of varying lifestyle needs and income levels.

Housing Affordability

- **GOAL 3.0:** Enhance housing affordability so that modest income households can join and remain an integral part of the Mill Valley community.

Address Governmental Constraints

- **GOAL 4.0:** Address governmental requirements and processes related to the maintenance, improvement and development of housing while maintaining community character.

Equal Housing Opportunities and Special Needs

- **GOAL 5.0:** Promote equal housing opportunities for all residents, including Mill Valley's special needs populations.

Sustainability and Energy Efficiency

- **GOAL 6.0:** Promote a healthy and sustainable Mill Valley through support of existing and new housing which minimizes reliance on natural resources.

Community and Governmental Collaboration

- **GOAL 7.0:** Coordinate with citizens, community groups, and governmental agencies to help address Mill Valley's housing needs.

Mill Valley adopted its 2015-2023 Housing Element in May 4, 2015. The City made exceptional progress in addressing all 38 Housing Programs, as discussed in Table D.1 below. Implementation of several housing programs was also executed through the work of the Housing Advisory Committee (HAC). In 2021, the HAC identified Housing Programs of interest and of a priority to the Committee that were specifically aimed at providing affordable housing opportunities within the community, such as seniors and the City's local workforce. including:

1. **Moving swiftly to reduce housing barriers and increase the supply of affordable housing for the local community.** The City has generated new housing in existing homes through the Home Match program (Program 27) and has established regulations for junior Accessory Dwelling Units (Program 8).
2. **Protecting existing rental housing stock.** Staff is working to evaluate multi-family residential units and establish a soft story ordinance to ensure that existing homes are protected and preserved (Program 3).
3. **Consider the use of public land to leverage funding or build on to create new affordable units.** Staff has worked with the Committee and City Council on this item, which is currently underway as part of the review of the northern portion of land at 1 Hamilton Drive (Program 10).

In summary, the City continues to recognize the importance of Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs) to diversify its housing stock and single-family zoned neighborhoods. The addition of Junior Accessory Dwelling Units (JADUs) and duplexes in single-family zoned areas will continue to create opportunities to diversify the footprints of single family homes to accommodate a range of households and lifestyles, including aging seniors, young adults and the workforce.

The City also recognizes that the community has fallen short on producing a significant number of units outside ADUs. Several multi-family projects were entitled but not built, including 550 Miller and 160 Corte Madera while other multi-family projects have been slow to construct units after receiving building permits, including 500 Miller and 542 Miller (see Appendix F for details). While constraints to development are real, including the lack of vacant land and larger sized lots over ½ acre, the City has identified a series of programs and incentives to facilitate the production and diversify of units, see Chapter 4 for details.

In cooperation with Marin Housing Authority, Mill Valley monitored all deed restricted rental and ownership housing to ensure compliance with affordability restrictions. The City met its conservation goal as no deed restricted units converted to market rate. *Marin Housing* reported that five Residential Rehabilitation loan was made in Mill Valley during the planning period. The level of rehabilitation activity has been very limited in Mill Valley. While the majority of the community's homeowners do not meet the low-income qualification requirements, this program could be particularly beneficial for senior homeowners with limited financial resources. Marin Housing has transitioned to owner occupied rehabilitation funds through the Cal Home program and also focuses on loans to build ADUs.

Table D.1 Status and Evaluation of 2015-2023 Housing Element Programs

Program	Progress and Accomplishments	Appropriateness and Considerations for HE Update	Housing Strategy
HOUSING & NEIGHBORHOOD QUALITY: Maintain and enhance the quality and affordability of existing housing and ensure new development is compatible with Mill Valley’s small-town character and many environmental, community neighborhood and scenic attributes.			
<p>1. Residential Design Guidelines. Develop and adopt Multi-Family Design Guidelines which address development compatibility and promote sustainable site design and building practices.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed<u>In process.</u></p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> The original set of <u>Multi-Family</u> design guidelines and standards adopted in 2016. Additional update in process to update standards and guidelines to address new state laws requiring “objective” standards and guidelines (SB 330, SB 35, Housing Accountability Act, etc.).</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> These Multi-family and Mixed Use guidelines have been effective in clearly illustrating development and design guidelines for multi-family and mixed-use projects. Prior to 2016, design guidelines did not exist. Establishment of design guidelines have helped clarify development requirements for applicants. The city is also working to identify “objective” standards and guidelines which will continue to help streamline the development review and approval process.</p>	<p>Include in update. “Objective” standards and guidelines pending public review. Coordinating with local jurisdictions and the County of Marin to develop a toolkit to address objective standards. Paid through State grant funding available through SB2.</p>	<p>Produce</p>
<p>2. Historic Preservation Guidelines and Incentives. Explore revising the H-O Ordinance to clarify demolition procedures and role of the Historical Society.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> In process.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> In 2021 City Council adopted a Historic Context Statement, Historic Resources Inventory Survey Report and Property List.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> The historic resources inventory list provides background information for those residents</p>	<p>Include in update. Next steps include developing a Historic Preservation Ordinance and local preservation incentives. <u>As a further means of streamlining development review, the City intends to evaluate regulations that are intended to provide incentives to preserve historic</u></p>	<p>Protect</p>

Program	Progress and Accomplishments	Appropriateness and Considerations for HE Update	Housing Strategy
	<p>owning properties on the list to further assess their <u>properties and is an effective means of streamlining CEQA evaluation.</u></p>	<p><u>resources, while also allowing for the adaptive reuse of such properties.</u></p>	
<p>3. Housing Maintenance and Public Information. Publicize rehabilitation assistance and energy retrofit programs. Goal to provide rehabilitation assistance to five lower income households.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>EffectivenessAccomplishments:</u> 2018-2021 included a county-wide grant to assist with energy retrofits.</p> <p>In 2021, Marin Clean Energy reported that it provided \$4,200 in home energy savings to <u>Mill Valley</u> residents.</p> <p>Marin Housing Authority also offers rehabilitation assistance <u>loan</u> to low-income households in Marin County. <u>Since 2017, Approximately \$1.3 million in loans have been provided to 42 Marin County households, with 1 household located in Mill Valley.</u></p> <p><u>Effectiveness: Low, based on participation rates. Consider targeted outreach to increase effectiveness. Also target Census Tract 1262, which has a higher proportion of seniors and lower income households.</u></p>	<p>Include in update. Program should include establishing relationships and/or partnerships with property managers/owners of Multi-Family Residential buildings so that information is exchanged on various opportunities that are available to maintain properties. Additional financial incentives could come from Trust Fund should it be identified as a priority. Require safety retrofits to Multi-Family Residential properties, including adoption of a soft story ordinance. <u>Provide targeted outreach to low-income households on energy and home improvement loan programs.</u></p>	<p>Protect <u>and Build Community</u></p>

Program	Progress and Accomplishments	Appropriateness and Considerations for HE Update	Housing Strategy
<p>4. Preservation of Existing Affordable Rental Housing.</p> <p>Consider regulations and incentives for property owners to maintain their existing rental housing as opposed to tearing down building and/or converting rental units to for-sale units or commercial space.</p> <p>Evaluate allowing rental projects to utilize funds that are set aside in a Local Affordable Housing Trust Fund (Program #17) for the purposes of rehabilitating buildings while maintaining affordable rent levels.</p> <p>Consider regulating short-term rentals (less than 30 days) in single family residential areas as a means of increasing the availability of rental properties for longer term residence (as opposed to vacation rentals).</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness- Accomplishments:</u> Short term rental program was established in 2016. All short-term rentals must register through business license process with supplemental forms and fees required to rent short term.</p> <p>Short term rentals are allowed only in Single Family Zoning Districts. However, new ADUs approved since 2018 may not be rented on a short-term (less than 30 day) basis. The City monitors short term rentals through a third party to ensure that the short-term rental is registered in Mill Valley.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> Staff continues to provide updates and monitor the number of short-term rentals in town. Currently, there are approximately 100 registered short-term rentals that operate in Mill Valley. <u>This monitoring program has been an effective approach in managing short term rentals and allows for the community to continue to evaluate changes to the program on an annual basis.</u></p>	<p><u>Maintain the short-term rental program.</u></p> <p>Consider modifying or adding Add a new program titled: “preserve existing housing” (not just affordable rental housing).</p> <p>Potential implementation measures could include: establishing anti-neglect regulations; increased demolition fees; etc.</p> <p>Consider 1-to-1 unit replacement requirement indicating that “non-vacant sites” must replace units affordable to the same or lower income level as a condition of any development on non-vacant site. This program will help address concerns about tear down/rebuild scenarios that reduce affordability of housing stock and also will allow existing non-conforming buildings that exceed current density standards to maintain the existing number of units on site.</p>	<p>Protect</p>

Program	Progress and Accomplishments	Appropriateness and Considerations for HE Update	Housing Strategy
<p>5. Preservation of Existing Deed Restricted Affordable Rental Housing. Continue to contract with MHA to ensure compliance with affordability restrictions. Require long-term affordability controls on future affordable housing units.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> <u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>There are over 300 existing deed restricted affordable housing units in Mill Valley. This program is quite effective in maintaining affordable housing stock in Mill Valley. The affordable inclusionary restriction now requires affordability in perpetuity.</u> Affordable rental housing typically managed through non-profit organizations that operate affordable housing sites. <u>These housing complexes continue to operate based on long-term leasing agreements. In 2022, the City extended its ground lease for an additional 10 years allowing Bridge Housing to secure Fannie Mae loan funding and continue to manage the 32-unit affordable family housing units at 651 Miller Avenue through the year 2065.</u></p> <p><u>In 2017, the affordable inclusionary restriction was updated and now requires affordability in perpetuity, which alleviates the potential expiration of affordable inclusionary units that the City is currently experiencing with those affordable inclusionary housing units built in the 1970's and 1980s.</u></p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> <u>This program is quite effective in maintaining affordable housing stock in Mill Valley.</u></p>	<p>Include in update. This has been effective in maintaining the affordability in over 300 existing housing units. Continue to extend the program with further opportunities through MHA <u>or other non-profit affordable housing operators. For those inclusionary units set to expire, establish an early warning system with Marin Housing Authority and develop an action plan for those at-risk inclusionary units set to expire.</u></p>	<p>Protect</p>

HOUSING SUPPLY & DIVERSITY: Provide opportunities for a range of housing types suited to residents of varying lifestyle needs & income levels.			
Program	Progress and Accomplishments	Notes- Considerations for HE Update	Housing Strategy
<p>6. Mixed Use Zoning in Commercial Districts. Evaluate modifications to residential development regulations in Commercial districts. Remove CUP for multi-family and mixed uses for residential above ground floor or off commercial street frontage.</p>	<p><u>Progress</u>: Partially Completed.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments</u>: <u>Development standards c</u>ontained Mixed Use / Multi-Family Development Standards adopted in 2016.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness</u>: This program has been effective in providing flexibility in commercial redevelopment <u>and adding housing to redevelopment in commercial areas</u>. All large redevelopment projects proposed in the City now include mixed use, typically with housing above the commercial space. <u>Examples include 500 Miller (9-unit mixed use project under construction); 550 Miller (6-unit mixed use project approved in 2020; and 65 Throckmorton (4-unit adaptive reuse of existing building completed in 2015).</u></p>	<p>Include in update. <u>To further streamline the development review and approval process, eliminate the conditional use permit.</u></p> <p><u>Remove the CUP requirement to permit for multi-family and mixed-use buildings in commercial areas must be removed.</u></p>	Enhance and Diversify
<p>7. Micro-Apartment Units. Explore the feasibility of encouraging and incentivizing micro-apartment units.</p>	<p><u>Progress</u>: Completed.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness</u>: <u>Accomplishments</u>: <u>Standards for micro-units c</u>ontained in Mixed Use/ Multi-Family Standards adopted in 2016.</p>	<p>Include in update. <u>Incorporate feedback from these proposals into the update, including eliminating the maximum number of micro-units allowed. Modify development standards to -if there is an interest to update the standard, such as modifying the -increase the ratio of allowable micro-units allowed per development.</u> (Regulations currently limit the number of</p>	Enhance and Diversify

	<p><u>-Effectiveness:</u> The program has been an effective incentive for small-scale units due to the reduced standards associated with micro units, including: the designation of a microunit at .5 density and reduced parking.</p> <p><u>Several development review applications have explored micro-units in development proposals, including 550 Miller Avenue and Lomita Drive.</u></p>	<p>microunits to 20% of the total units in a development).</p>	
--	--	--	--

<p>8. Second Units/Accessory Dwelling Units (ADUs). Conduct a survey of recently built second units, and adopt ordinance amendments to ensure maintenance of second units as per City approval. Seek to create an average of eight second units annually.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed & On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>The County-wide ADU website (ADUMarin.org) was launched in late 2020, which was funded through the SB2 grant. The website provides information on regulations, floor plans, video testimonials and a calculator for establishing approximate costs. Three county-wide webinars were hosted to facilitate discussion and interest in ADUs.</u></p> <p>The ADU Ordinance was updated in 2021. The regulations continue to balance the production of housing with hazards and safety (see Program 35). A county-wide survey conducted in 2020 <u>confirming similar results describing the use and affordability ranges of ADUs in Marin County (see Appendix G). The survey results are supported by similar results identified in the City’s 2014 ADU Survey of how ADUs are utilized and rented.</u></p> <p><u>Effectiveness.</u> <u>The City’s ADU program continues to be an effective way of diversifying housing (size and affordability) in single-family zoning districts.</u> The City is averaging well over its target of generating 8 new ADUs a year. In 2021, 29 building permits were issued for ADUs.</p>	<p>Include in update. Additional updates anticipated update. Modify ADU regulations to address Very High Fire Severity Zone and other community interests such as promote new state ADU regulations that facilitate and ADUs allow ADU above an attached garage, which is of interest to some members of the community.</p> <p>The County-wide ADU website (ADUMarin.org) was launched in late 2020, which was funded through the SB2 grant. The website provides information on regulations, floor plans, video testimonials and a calculator for establishing approximate costs. Three county wide webinars were hosted to facilitate discussion and interest in ADUs.</p>	<p>Enhance and Diversify</p>
---	---	--	------------------------------

<p>9. Junior Second Units. Consider adopting regulations.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Adopted <u>JADU regulations</u> in 2020. See Program 8 above.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness.</u> This program has been effective, with over 5 new JADUs permitted since the regulations have been adopted <u>in 2020</u>.</p>	<p>Do not include in update. <u>Modify the JADU regulations in MVMC 20.90, as needed, to address any changes to state law.</u></p>	<p>Enhance and Diversify</p>
<p>10. Affordable Housing Overlay. Adopt an Affordable Housing Overlay for the Redwoods site, specifying development incentives tailored to the site. Coordinate with property owners in facilitating public review of development proposals, and in application for affordable housing funds.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>City staff continues to coordinate with Redwoods on potential redevelopment.</u> but the facility does not currently have any plans for expanding at this time.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness.</u> <u>This overlay has not been executed to date, and therefore has not been determined as effective, as the existing This program is tied to development interest from the Redwoods Senior Center and awaits further discussion with Redwoods about redevelopment on their site. To increase effectiveness, expand overlay opportunities in the Housing Element Update.</u></p>	<p>Include in update and expand overlay opportunities. Three new overlays are proposed for the Housing Element Update to facilitate affordable housing, including: office conversion, small lots and opportunity sites. <u>A forth affordable housing overlay is also proposed for other sites, to facilitate development interest and discussion with other tax-exempt landowners such as schools and religious institutions.</u></p>	<p>Produce</p>
<p>11. Lot Consolidation Incentives. Adopt lot consolidation incentives in coordination with Multi-family Design Guidelines.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>None to date.</u></p>	<p>Include in update. Additional incentives will be available for those parcels on the sites inventory and proposed overlay (Program 10).</p>	<p>Produce</p>

	<p><u>Effectiveness.</u> None of the lots identified in the 2015-2023 Housing Element were consolidated <u>and is there not considered an effective program as written.</u> The lack of consolidation is likely due to existing use on the properties and not being owned by the same property owner(s). To make this program more effective, the City should focus on those adjacent properties that are owned by the same owners that can consolidate properties as part of redevelopment.</p>		
<p>12. Publicly-Owned Land for Affordable Housing. Prepare inventory of publicly-owned land. Modify City’s zoning regulations to allow residential uses in C-F zones.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Partially Completed.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>Effectiveness:</u>—City staff has worked through the Housing Advisory Committee on this program. On June 21, 2021 City Council reviewed and accepted the Housing Advisory Committee’s recommendations to select the northern portion of the 1 Hamilton city-owned parcel and issue a Request for Qualifications to solicit interest and partner with a non-profit home builder. This portion of land has been deemed “exempt surplus land” for the sole purpose of building affordable homes on the property and the City has an exclusive negotiating agreement with EAH Housing <u>to determine the feasibility of building affordable rental housing on the 1 Hamilton property.</u></p>	<p>Include in update. Update this program to <u>identify next steps for building affordable rental housing on the 1 Hamilton site and action that will be taken to</u> further evaluate housing opportunities on public owned properties, including: a) further collaboration with educational facilities and religious institutions to facilitate housing opportunities; b) further investigation of city-owned parcels, particularly the Miller Avenue and Edgewood sites, to remove existing barriers to development (e.g. floodway designation and open space easement); and c) use of the City’s Affordable Housing Trust Fund to assist with feasibility studies to determine redevelopment potential.</p> <p><u>In addition to City-owned sites, the City will also</u> fFurther explore an “C-Affordable housing overlay” based on interests from property owners and to better understand how housing could be incorporated onto such sites. As part of the 2023-2031 Housing Element update, staff had</p>	<p>Produce</p>

	<p><u>Effectiveness: The program has been effective in identifying a site to build affordable housing on. Based on preliminary site planning and design, EAH Housing and the City have determined that it is feasible to build approximately 40-50 rental units on the property. Additional design and environmental review is required as part of the development review application that will be submitted by the City in 2023.</u></p>	<p>discussed modifying zoning regulations in CF Zones. Several members of the public have expressed concern applying blanket regulations to allow residential uses in C-F zones currently occupied by churches, schools and city-facilities. Additional research required to determine how to balance and not lose these community assets to housing. Some members of the community have indicated to select certain parcels rather than all C-F Zoned properties.</p>	
<p>13. Non-Traditional Housing Types. Modify Zoning Ordinance to develop standards for new housing typologies.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Partially completed.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Regulations include junior accessory dwelling units and duplexes in single family zones. The City has also launched the Home Match program to facilitate co-housing/shared housing opportunities.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> These programs have helped facilitate housing opportunities within existing Single-Family homes, including 5 home matches and 5 Junior ADUs since 2021. <u>Program effectiveness may be increased by providing informational webinars and promotion of new housing typologies allowed, particularly in single-family zoned areas.</u></p>	<p>Include in update. Adopting provisions for a variety of housing types which cater to all economic segments remains appropriate to the updated Housing Element. <u>In the short-term, include an informational webinar for single-family homeowners on how to incorporate additional housing opportunities into their footprint, including JADUs, home sharing, legalizing space through ADU conversions, lot splits and duplexes. In the longer term, add Additional to policies to consider include: Rregulations for and development standards for co-housing or and live/work housing.</u></p>	<p>Enhance and Diversify</p>

<p>14. Maintain and Monitor Capacity in Sites Inventory. Amend Ordinance to strengthen and enhance the program’s effectiveness in providing affordable housing.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed and On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>Minimum density standards were established in 2013 as part of the General Plan Update to ensure that multi-family and commercial zoned sites are being redeveloped in an efficient manner and comply with the no net loss provisions of state law.</u></p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> <u>This program has had limited effectiveness in terms of producing affordable housing on those commercial and multi-family zoned sites identified in the sites inventory due to the lack of redevelopment of these sites.</u></p>	<p>Include in update. Minimum density standards exist to ensure that multi-family and commercial zoned sites are being redeveloped in an efficient manner. <u>Add programs that provide incentives for those sites identified on the sites inventory to redevelop, such as modified development standards.</u></p> <p><u>Include analysis to comply with state law regarding previously identified sites and non-vacant sites. Previously used sites or identified to fulfill the jurisdiction's obligation to accommodate lower-income housing need unless must be rezoned to the jurisdiction's default density of 20 units/acre and the zoning allows for residential development by right if at least twenty percent (20%) of the units are affordable to lower-income households.</u></p>	<p>Produce</p>
--	--	---	----------------

HOUSING AFFORDABILITY: Enhance housing affordability so that modest income households can join and remain an integral part of the Mill Valley community.			
Program	Progress and Accomplishments	Notes- Considerations for HE Update	Housing Strategy
<p>15. Inclusionary Housing Regulations. Amend Zoning Ordinance to strengthen effectiveness of providing affordable housing and comply with state law.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Extensive update (2017), small update to incorporate requirements for rental units (2018). Requires projects with four or more units to build 25% of new units at affordable levels (split between low and moderate).</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> The number of new units generated from larger multi-family and mixed-use redevelopment projects subject to the inclusionary ordinance includes 4-3 projects (65 Throckmorton, 542 Miller, and 550 Miller and 160 Corte Madera) totaling 33-24 units (of which six units are deed-restricted affordable units)-approved during the 2015-2023 RHNA. It is unclear if the limited redevelopment of larger scale project is attributed to the inclusionary ordinance or other factors such as the extreme cost of land and/or other development standards and should be further evaluated in the future Housing Element.</p>	<p>Include in update. As a first step in evaluating the inclusionary ratio, waive the inclusionary requirement as part of Program 20 (housing overlays). After the execution of the housing overlays, re-evaluate the inclusionary ordinance to consider relaxed or waived inclusionary ratios for those projects that produce smaller scale units or other diversified housing such as rental units.</p>	<p>Produce</p>
<p>16. Single-Family Housing Impact Fee. Conduct nexus study to assess impact of single-family construction on affordable housing demand.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> A 1% fee is collected for all residential remodels over \$105K. These fees are deposited in the Affordable Housing Trust Fund earmarked to fund projects that enhance, produce or protect affordable housing.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> Approximately \$300K is collected annually with the Fund at \$1M since 2018. The Trust Fund has been effective in providing funding for the Home Match Program and 1 Hamilton environmental and feasibility studies.</p>	<p>Include in update indicating City Council to monitor the impact fee to determine the applicability every 5 years (as required under the mitigation fee act).</p>	<p>Protect Enhance Produce</p>

<p>17. Local Affordable Housing Fund. Establish a dedicated Affordable Housing Fund with implementing regulations for deposit of in-lieu fee revenues.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> March 2020 City Council approved the administrative guidelines for the Trust Fund for funds to be utilized. Priority funding identified as part of the Housing Advisory Committee priority work plan items.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> See 16 above.</p>	<p>Include in update.</p>	<p>Protect Enhance Produce</p>
<p>18. Affordable Housing Development Assistance. Provide financial and regulatory incentives to private developers for affordable housing.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going. Loan programs available through Marin County and Marin Housing Authority. Currently, the City is utilizing Affordable Housing Trust Funds to finance a potential project on city-owned property. Regulatory incentives include reduced fees for low-income housing and incentives under Density Bonus law.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>In October 2022, MVMC 5.32 was amended to waive 100% of fees for those affordable housing projects with 10% extremely low income units.</u></p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> Funding incentives from the City remain small but are now available through the Housing Trust Fund, see 16 and 17 above. <u>Recent updates to MVMC 5.32 has been effective in increasing funding opportunities, including access to Marin County Affordable Housing Funds and increasing local matching funds to help qualify for additional federal funding.</u></p>	<p>Include in update. Additional financial incentives could also come from Trust Fund, should it be identified as a priority.</p>	<p>Enhance Produce</p>
<p>19. Partnerships for Affordable Housing. Work through Nonprofit Housing Association of Northern California to identify and explore partnerships with affordable housing providers.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Coordination with <u>through Nonprofit Housing Association of Northern California</u>, Marin County and Marin Housing Authority continues.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> <u>This program has had limited effectiveness due to staff resources. Update the Housing Element to require</u></p>	<p>Include in update. Add quarterly check ins with the non-profit group to continue collaboration and partnership.</p>	<p>Enhance Produce</p>

	<p><u>M</u>ore coordination needed with the non-profit and <u>on-going</u> basis.</p>		
<p>20. Homebuyer Assistance. Continue participation with Marin Housing to administer Below Market Rate homeownership program.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going. Required as part of the City’s inclusionary housing program (25% of all new units in developments of 4 or more must be sold or rented at low and moderate affordability levels).</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> The City continues to participate in the County first time homebuyer programs, and has created a Housing Resource page on the City's website which provides information on the programs. In addition, the City partners with the Chamber of Commerce to ensure that the local workforce is provided the information and opportunity to participate in these programs.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> The City has been effective in providing information about available first-time homebuyer assistance. There continues to be a long waiting list of those interested in purchasing BMR homes. To increase effectiveness, additional supply of units is required. Address in the Housing Element Update through the production of units and maintaining inclusionary housing requirements.</p>	<p>Include in update and expand this program to further fair housing.</p>	<p>Produce</p>

<p>21. Section 8 Rental Assistance. Continue to offer tenants information regarding Section 8 and encourage landlords to register units with the program.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>EffectivenessAccomplishments:</u> In August 2018, the County executed a \$450,000 contract with Marin Housing Authority to renew its Landlord Partnership Program for a second two-year period. The program incentivizes landlord participation in the Housing Choice Voucher program and provides security deposit assistance of tenants. The Landlord Partnership Program works in conjunction with the increasing number of sources of income ordinances within the County to increase success rates for voucher holders.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> In 2018, Marin Housing Authority reported a five percent increase in the success rate; it averaged roughly 60 percent throughout the year.</p>	<p>Include in update and expand this program to further fair housing.</p>	<p>Protect</p>
--	--	---	----------------

GOVERNMENT CONSTRAINTS: Address governmental constraints on the maintenance, improvement and development of housing while maintaining community character.			
Program	Progress and Accomplishments	Notes- Considerations for HE Update	Housing Strategy

<p>22. Update Land Use Map and Zoning Code. Establish minimum and maximum residential densities for residential districts, and maximum densities and development standards for residential uses in commercial districts. Monitor to ensure adequate sites to address RHNA.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Complete and ongoing.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Minimum and maximum densities completed with General Plan Update in 2013.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> The City was effective in <u>updating its Land Use Map and establishing minimum and maximum allowable densities</u>, and thus providing for a more transparent and efficient development review process. Additional updates required to <u>ensure adequate sites</u> achieve RHNA.</p>	<p>Include in update and expand <u>program</u> to address required rezoning <u>to accommodate RHNA and satisfy state laws discussed below</u>.</p> <p>Required rezoning program: new overlay zoning districts to accommodate RHNA.</p> <p>Rezone the Miller Ave/Presidio area to align Land Use and Zoning so the designated uses are compatible.</p> <p>Rezone 300 East Blithedale (Comcast Building)</p> <p>Required rezoning program: all residential projects in commercial areas. Because the City must rely on commercial and mixed use sites to accommodate over 50% of its very low- and low-income RHNA, the City will be required to rezone those commercial and mixed use sites that are identified in the Sites Inventory to allow fully residential projects and require that for any mixed-use projects proposed on those sites that 50% of the floor area must be occupied for residential uses. <u>Rezoning must occur within 3 years of adoption of the Housing Element (January 2026)</u>.</p> <p><u>Required rezoning program: By-right approval. Those sites previously identified on the sites inventory and are identified for lower-income RHNA will be rezoned to allow by-right approvals, should the redevelopment include 20% of the units as affordable to lower-income households.</u> Rezoning must occur within 3 years of adoption of the Housing Element (January 2026).</p>	<p>Enhance Produce</p>
---	--	---	----------------------------

<p>23. Update Parking Standards. Evaluate and establish modified parking standards in the Zoning Ordinance to facilitate specific types of housing.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed and On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Micro units and ADUs have reduced parking standards. Multi-Family projects with 4 or more units qualify for Density Bonus reduced parking standards based on the City’s inclusionary requirements. The City also offers shared parking between commercial and residential use.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> Reduced parking standards are an effective incentive for building smaller scale units that are more affordable by design.</p>	<p>Include in update. Additional reduced parking standards proposed as part of the housing overlays that will be adopted as part of the Housing Element Update.</p>	<p>Produce</p>
<p>24. Fee Deferrals and/or Waivers for Affordable Housing. Provide information to affordable housing community on fee deferrals, reductions and waivers. Amend Code to waive of 100% of application processing fees for projects with 10% Extremely Low Income units.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> The Affordable Housing Ordinance was adopted in 2017 and allows for reduced fees for those units that are affordable.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> There are limited projects that have taken advantage of the fee deferrals so the effectiveness cannot be measured. <u>Reduced fees has been effective in the 1 Hamilton city-owned project in 1) reducing fees and 2) securing funds from outside organizations, which require fee waivers to qualify for funding.</u></p>	<p>Include in update. <u>In 2022 the City updates its Code has not been updated</u> to waive 100% of application processing fees for those projects with 10% Extremely Low-Income units.</p>	<p>Enhance Produce</p>

<p>25. Density Bonus and Other incentives for Affordable Housing. Adopt a local density bonus ordinance, and clarify relationship with City’s inclusionary housing ordinance.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Density Bonus ordinance adopted in 2015. <u>Duplex ordinance to address SB 9 adopted in November 2021.</u></p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> <u>To date, one redevelopment project has taken advantage of density bonus regulations (550 Miller Avenue).</u> - The City's Ddensity bonus <u>regulations are ordinance is</u> effective in providing zoning incentives for the provisions of affordable housing.</p> <p><u>To increase effectiveness, update program to include outreach and summary handout on state incentives and allowances as part of redevelopment.</u></p>	<p>Include in update. Include “streamlining” in the Housing Program title.</p> <p>Additional modifications proposed as part of “overlay” zoning districts that will be reviewed as part of the 2023-2031 Housing Element Update.</p> <p>Add required streamlined approval process to this program. Because the City does not have adequate vacant sites and therefore must rely on non-vacant sites to accommodate its lower income RHNA, State law requires that the City establish a process by which projects proposed on those sites that designate 20% of the units as affordable to lower income households are subject to by-right approvals without discretionary review. Must include a minimum density of 20 dwelling units/acre, a maximum density of at least 30 units/acre, and be large enough to accommodate at least 16 units per site.</p>	<p>Produce</p>
<p>26. CEQA Exemptions for Infill Projects. Utilize categorical exemptions where appropriate, case-by-case basis.</p>	<p><u>Progress.</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>The majority of redevelopment projects qualify for infill, thus streamlining process and cost for applicants.</u></p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> The City has been effective in reducing project processing times and associated costs through use of CEQA exemptions for qualified urban infill projects where site characteristics and an absence of</p>	<p>Do not include in update as it is implied and required by law.</p>	<p>Protect Enhance Produce</p>

	potentially significant environmental impacts allow.		
--	--	--	--

EQUAL HOUSING & SPECIAL NEEDS: Promote equal housing opportunities for all residents, including Mill Valley’s special needs populations.			
Program	Progress and Accomplishments	Notes- Considerations for HE Update	Housing Strategy
<p>27. Fair Housing Program. Publicize the program through brochures and on the City’s website.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Complete and On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Source of income ordinance adopted in 2005. Housing Resources website: https://ca-millvalley.civicplus.com/916/Housing-Resources</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> Limited effectiveness due to small scope. Expand scope of source of income ordinance.</p>	<p>Include in update and expand. Existing policies and programs should be further explored to ensure that the City is addressing state requirements. Additional materials will be developed to analyze the County of Marin and Mill Valley in terms of: (1) segregation and integration, (2) racially and ethnically concentrated areas of poverty, (3) access to opportunity, and (4) disproportionate housing needs, including displacement.</p>	Community/ Workforce
<p>28. Senior Support Services. Continue to support the provision of senior services in Mill Valley.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Mill Valley’s Parks & Recreation Department has continued to provide a wide variety of services to senior citizens at the Mill Valley Community Center. Mill Valley Seniors’ Club, under the sponsorship of the City and support by City’s Senior Services Coordinator, meets weekly at the Center and provides input on senior programming. Recent activity through Age-Friendly Cities and Home Match program.</p>	<p>Include in update.</p>	Community/ Workforce

	<p><u>Effectiveness:</u> The City has been effective in providing an array of services to seniors to support their well-being and independence.</p>		
<p>29. Home Sharing and Tenant Matching Opportunities. Support organizations that facilitate housing sharing; actively promote through senior citizen organizations.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> In September 2020, the City Council approved a contract with Covia Foundation to assist the City in Home Matching opportunities.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> As of March 2021<u>December 2022</u>, five-nine home matches have been established, with several-three other <u>in home opportuntiees</u> in process.</p>	<p>Include in update. City Council to discuss the Home Match program at an upcoming Council meeting to evaluate the effectiveness of the program.</p>	<p>Community/ Workforce</p>
<p>30. Universal Design/ Visitability. Develop and promote guidelines encouraging principles of universal design and visitability.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>Adopted</u> in 2016 as part of the Multi-Family/Mixed Use Design Guidelines. Added features related to visibility as part of Tier 1 Green Building requirements.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> Utilizing the building code to require added features has been effective for incorporating small features into renovations.</p>	<p>Include in update as part of updating any multi-family regulations. See Program 33 below.</p> <p>Additional work can be done to further promote ways in which to plan for ADA features as part of design. <u>See Program 33 below.</u></p>	<p>Community/ Workforce</p>
<p>31. Homeless Assistance. Support implementation of the Homeless Countywide Continuum of Care, publicize the Marin Community Resource Guide and emergency 211 call system.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>Work collaboratively with the City and Councilmember appointed to Countywide Continuum program</u></p>	<p>Include in update. <u>Continue</u> <u>co</u>ordination with Marin County. Additional work can be done in term of collaboration and coordination as part of the Marin County Housing Working Group to strengthen outreach to</p>	<p>Community/ Workforce</p>

	<p><u>Effectiveness:</u> Since the start of COVID-19 and subsequent shelter-in-place orders, Marin County staff (Housing and Federal Grants Division) have worked very closely with HHS staff in direct pandemic housing response around Marin’s emergency motels, rental assistance and Homekey programs.</p>	<p>provide housing services to those in need.</p>	
--	--	---	--

SUSTAINABILITY & ENERGY EFFICIENCY: Promote a healthy and sustainable Mill Valley through support of existing and new housing which minimizes reliance on natural resources and automobile use.			
Program	Progress and Accomplishments	Notes- Considerations for HE Update	Housing Strategy
32. Prioritization of Sustainable Housing Projects. Prioritize projects in sustainable locations competing for funds/grants.	<u>Progress:</u> On-going. <u>Accomplishments:</u> See Program 33/Green Building. <u>Effectiveness:</u> All new residential projects and major remodels qualify and require CalGreen Tier 1 To date, a housing project has not competed for funding therefore this program has not been evaluated in terms of its effectiveness and thus eliminate the ability to prioritize projects since they all qualify.	Modify in update based on effectiveness.	Enhance Produce

<p>33. Green Building. Provide outreach and education to developers regarding CALGREEN and the Green Building Ordinance. Evaluate incentives for Green Building Ordinance for higher energy efficiency.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going, updated bi-annually based on Building Code Updates.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Mill Valley is currently Tier 1 CalGreen (including Title 24) for large remodels, new single-family homes and small multi-family projects. Tier 1 CalGreen (without Title 24) for larger multi-family projects.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> <u>This program has been effective, as it requires all new residential projects and major remodels to satisfy CalGreen Tier 1 requirements.</u> Energy conservation has been a successful tool in reducing emissions and conserving resources within the community, <u>while also reducing operating costs of housing (heat, electricity, etc.).</u> Mill Valley’s recent greenhouse gas emissions inventory indicates that building related electricity emissions have been reduced by 80% (from 2005 baseline levels in the community)¹.</p>	<p>Include in update and continue to strive toward zero net energy and use of Tiers to achieve earlier results than state timelines.</p>	<p>Enhance Produce</p>
<p>34. Energy Conservation. Implement actions for energy efficiency identified in the General Plan.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going. See Program 33/Green Building.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Implementation through the CalGreen/Green Building Code, Climate Action Plan and Coordination with Marin Climate and Energy Partnership.</p>	<p>Consider incorporating <u>Incorporate</u> as part of Program 33.</p>	<p>Enhance Produce</p>

¹ City of Mill Valley, “Greenhouse Gas Inventory for Community Emissions for Year 2020”, July 2022.

	<p><u>Effectiveness:</u> The City has been effective in working with state and federal agencies to address the FEMA floodplain. More recently, the City has been effective in working jointly with other Marin County jurisdictions to address sea level rise, and the potential hazards that may arise with such a condition.</p>		
<p>35. Addressing Natural Hazards. Incorporate references to the Floodplain Management Ordinance in the 2040 General Plan as required by AB 162. Review Housing Element whenever General Plan amendments are made to ensure consistency.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> In process. Over 33% of the City's parcels are in Very High Fire Severity Zones, and are adjacent to narrow roadways with limited access. In 2020, the City hosted several study sessions with Planning Commission and City Council to discuss and investigate options to balance fire safety with state ADUs law.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Staff continues to evaluate options for regulating ADUs in Very High Fire Severity Zones and/or other areas with natural hazards. Staff also continues to provide information and feedback on proposed state legislation in recognition of surrounding natural hazards.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> On-going coordination and collaboration with state officials is required in order to effectively balance local topography and natural hazards with state housing interests.</p>	<p>Include in update.</p>	<p>Protect Enhance Produce</p>

COMMUNITY & GOVERNMENT COLLABORATION			
Program	Progress and Accomplishments	Notes- Considerations for HE Update	Housing Strategy

<p>36. Community Education and Outreach. Provide education and outreach on housing issues, assist prospective applicants, and coordinate with interested groups.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> On-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> Housing summit conducted in 2017 and the Housing Advisory Committee established in 2019 as the forum to discuss housing issues and assist staff in implementing Housing Element programs.</p> <p>The City also has a robust communications/ outreach program for various interests within the Community. News items are posted on the website, and e-mail notifications are sent out on various topics to members of the community on a regular basis. Social media is also utilized by the City to connect with its residents, including Facebook and Twitter. Notices are sent to property owners within 300-500 feet about the proposed development and hearing process.</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> The City has been very effective in keeping the citizenry informed about the Housing Element update and associated zoning implementation. <u>The City of Mill Valley’s Planning Department webpage includes information and access to housing resources; zoning and land use information; development fees and outlines the development review process.</u></p> <p><u>The City also has a robust communications / outreach program for various interests within the Community. News items are posted on the website, and e-mail notifications are sent out on various topics to members of the community on a regular basis to over 10,000 email subscribers.</u></p>	<p>Include in update. Staff coordinates with other local jurisdictions on housing-related matters on a regular and ongoing basis on various topics such as homelessness, diversifying housing, new legislation, and affordable housing opportunities. Outreach and discussion occur through City Council meetings, as well as meetings with the Housing Advisory Committee (see below).</p>	<p>Community/ Workforce</p>
---	--	---	---------------------------------

	<p><u>Social media is also utilized by the City to connect with its residents, including Facebook and Twitter. Notices are sent to property owners within 300-500 feet about the proposed development and hearing process.</u></p> <p><u>Lastly, the Housing Advisory Committee has been effective in assisting staff in the implementation of several housing programs, see Program 38 for details.</u></p>		
<p>37. Housing Element Monitoring/Annual Report. Submit an annual report to HCD by April 1 of each year, with the first annual report due April 1, 2014.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> In process and on-going.</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>Based on building permits issued, the City of Mill Valley has successfully met its regional housing goal of 129 units for the 2014-2023 Housing Element.</u></p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> The City has been effective in monitoring implementation of the Housing Element, documenting new housing units created on an annual basis. The annual reporting is communicated with the public and discussed with the Housing Advisory Committee and City Council.</p>	<p>Include in update. Based on building permits issued, the City of Mill Valley has successfully met its regional housing goal of 129 units for the 2014-2023 Housing Element.</p>	<p>Community/ Workforce</p>
<p>38. Mill Valley Housing Advisory Committee. Establish Mill Valley Housing Advisory Committee and define roles and responsibilities.</p>	<p><u>Progress:</u> Completed and on-going. By</p> <p><u>Accomplishments:</u> <u>Committee by-laws, workplan and priorities were established in 2019. Priority work programs for the Housing Advisory Committee in 2020 and 2021 included:</u> leveraging existing, underutilized housing through a Home Sharing Program (HE Program 29 above) and identification of public land to</p>	<p>Include in update as part of continued work to assist staff in implementing Housing Element programs. <u>Based on implementation, revisit Committee priorities and/or further execute priorities based on revised implementation for Housing Programs 29 and 12.</u></p>	<p>Community/ Workforce</p>

	<p>leverage an affordable housing project (HE Program 12 above).</p> <p><u>Effectiveness:</u> The creation of the Housing Advisory Committee has been effective in assisting staff in regular check-ins to discuss on-going implementation of Housing Programs. <u>In November 2019, City Council approved the Committee's above-referenced priorities, all of which have been addressed by the Committee.</u></p>		
--	--	--	--

Evaluation of 2015-2023 RHNA

As illustrated in Table D.2, based on building permits issued between January 2015 and December 2023, Mill Valley fulfilled its total regional housing construction needs, or "RHNA" for 292 new units. The City is currently not subject to SB35 based on the issuance of building permits for new units at the various affordability levels.

Table D.2: New Dwelling Units based on Building Permit Activity, by Year and Affordability

5 th Cycle RHNA	Very Low Income	Low Income	Moderate Income	Above Moderate	Total
2015	6	8	3	9	26
2016	4	3	2	2	10
2017	6	5	5	4	20
2018	5	3	3	4	15
2019	5	6	4	11	26
2020	6	6	3	1	16
2021	10	10	10	15	45
TOTAL UNITS PERMITTED	42	41	30	46	159
RHNA (2014-2023)	41	24	26	38	129
% Achieved	102%	170%	115%	121%	139%

Source: Staff analysis based on Annual Progress Reports to HCD. Accessory Dwelling Units are spread throughout the various income levels based on the formula derived from the ADU survey conducted in 2014 and aligns with BAY Area ADU survey ratios, both surveys approved by HCD.